A Comparative Study on the Corporate Social Responsibility Practices of Global Clothing Retailers

Nomindari Mendee, Vrije Universiteit Brussel

ABSTRACT


Keywords: corporate social responsibility – fast fashion – core-periphery thesis – CSR integration pattern – comparative study

1. INTRODUCTION

The world has become largely interconnected and globalised thanks to technological advancements made during the last couple of decades (Steger, 2003). Globalisation has played a major role in facilitating multinational corporations (MNCs) to gain increasing economic power in today’s rapidly changing world (Halme & Laurila, 2009). Irresponsible acts of some multinationals started grabbing the attention of the media. As their unethical and controversial business practices came to the surface, the topic of corporate social responsibility (CSR) rose in popularity among the MNCs.

Initially, CSR was understood as a company’s contribution towards charitable causes, however, thanks to the decades-long research work, the concept of CSR has grown into various theories and interpretations (Garriga & Mele, 2004). One of the well-known definitions of CSR between researchers was put together by Watts and Hulme (1999), who regarded CSR as a firm’s commitment to behave ethically and contribute to economic development, while improving the life quality of the employees and their families, as well as the local community and society at large. Acting responsibly in the absence of legal requirements (Vogel, 2007) is also a popular definition of CSR.

While the number of studies in the field of CSR has increased, the progress on defining an effective CSR implementation framework for academic purposes has stagnated (Lindgreen & Swaen, 2010). The available models and implications for managers are not clear (Porter & Kramer, 2006). At the same time, a growing number of companies are trying to jump on the CSR bandwagon either because of its strategic importance or for some defensive reasons, or simply because they are altruistic (Vogel, 2007). The main factors that make CSR interesting for a corporation according to Lindgreen et al. (2009) is the idea that it creates a competitive advantage (Porter & Kramer, 2006) by enhancing its image and reputation (Fombrun & Shanly, 1990), and producing engaged employees (Maignan et al., 1999) who in return can go the extra mile for the organisation. The increased demand for an effective CSR implementation model on the one hand, and the
A Comparative Study on the Corporate Social Responsibility Practices of Global Clothing Retailers

Ambiguity around the current CSR integration models on the other hand call for more research on the topic.

As of the mid-1990s, many of the well-known fashion brands have been criticised in the media after committing controversial business practices, such as child labour and inhumane working conditions in low-cost production countries. The brands under public scrutiny after the incidents started using CSR practices to reposition their corporate image in the eyes of consumers and other stakeholders (Sweeney & Coughlan, 2008). Although several studies have been carried out around the topic of CSR practices in various industries, there is a general lack of research examining the CSR activities of MNCs in the field of fashion retail. With its environmentally challenging procurement methods and ethically controversial manufacturing processes, the fashion industry is an interesting academic domain to explore the integration patterns of CSR activities.

Through this thesis, I attempt to gain an insight into the CSR integration patterns of multinational enterprises in the fast fashion industry, by conducting a comparative study on the CSR disclosure reports of eight major multinational clothing retailers. Table 1 gives more details on the chosen samples. The focus of this research is twofold. Firstly, I identify the CSR activities of the retailers by applying the core-periphery thesis (Hannan & Freeman, 1984; Siggelkow, 2002, Yuan et al., 2011), and the seven patterns of CSR initiative adoption formulated by Yuan et al., (2011). Secondly, I discern differences in CSR integration patterns between publicly and privately owned MNCs based on the conducted CSR identification and classification. The research is limited to one industry. A thorough content analysis was conducted on the CSR reports of the multinational fashion retailers.

The structure of this thesis is as follows. In the next section, a literature review is conducted. This section also includes the hypotheses of the research. After the literature review, the methodology of this study is outlined. A conclusion is drawn at the end of this paper.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Corporate social responsibility

The concept of corporate social responsibility has been present in management scholarship for over half a century (Wood, 2010). It regards a corporate conscience where a corporation “behaves ethically and contributes to economic development, while improving the quality of life of its employees, the local community, and society at large” (Watts & House, 1999). Organisations’ efforts to address environmental issues are also part of CSR (Lindgreen & Swaen, 2010). Additionally, acting responsibly in the absence of legal requirements (Voigel, 2007) is a well-known definition of the topic. The conceptual roots of CSR lie in the stakeholder theory, which indicates that besides shareholders there are other interest groups such as customers, employees, suppliers etc., to whom an organisation should have obligations (Carroll, 1999; Freeman, 1983).

Through the years, CSR has moved from ideology to reality, and is considered by many to be important for an organisation to define its role in society and apply social and ethical standards to its business (Lichtenstein et al., 2004). Organisations use CSR reporting as a key tool to communicate with stakeholders about their CSR activities (Globes & Bartlett, 2007). However, companies engaging in CSR reporting often face challenges of maintaining the desired positive image while disclosing less attractive details to their stakeholders (Dietz & Lewis, 2005; argenti & Forman, 2002). According to some research done in the beginning of 2000, organisations do not always benefit from communicating about social activities, primarily because CSR communication can make the stakeholders sceptical (Schelgel & Pollach, 2005) as such reports are self-produced.

Although CSR reporting is mostly done on a voluntary basis, it is becoming mandatory in some countries such as Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland and the United Kingdom (Bonson & Bendiárová, 2015). Various standards are developed at a global level. These standards include AA1000, GRI, ISO 14001, ISO 26000, OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises, and UN Global Compact Principles (Maimon et al., 2012).

2.2. Core-periphery approach to CSR

According to numerous scholars, organisations are composed of core and peripheral elements (Yuan et al., 2011). Core elements are tied closely to a company’s goals and strategy (Hannan & Freeman, 1984), and they define the organisation’s identity and determine the distribution of its resources (Yuan et al., 2011), and interact with many other elements within the organisation (Siggelkow, 2002). Peripheral elements on the other hand include operating decisions taken in order to align the organisation with its environment and to mitigate risks of external fluctuations to the organisation’s core elements (Yuan et al., 2011).

Yuan et al. (2011) have further developed a new organising framework where they have divided peripheral practices into two subgroups, namely core-extending routines and inde-
pendent peripheral routines. The core-extending routines interact with several other current organisational practices and have a moderate influence on future organisational routines (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015). The independent peripheral practices on the other hand, are not fundamental to the firm's strategy and operations, do not exert much influence on the firm's future development, and are easily divestible (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015; Yuan et al., 2011).

The core-periphery approach has already been applied several times into organisations' CSR practices. This perspective assesses the process of setting up organisational routines and the relationships among them (Yuan et al., 2011). According to Aguinis & Glavas (2013) core CSR initiatives are integrated within a firm's strategy, routines and operations; whereas core-extending and peripheral CSR focus on activities that have moderate to no integration with an organisation's strategy, routines and operations. For example, green supply chain initiatives in a large manufacturing company are core CSR practices because they have profound influence on the company's core business activities, and they can change the way the firm operates in the future (Zhu et al., 2010). On the contrary, corporate philanthropic practices are often, to a great extent, separate from the core business routines, and thus are independent peripheral CSR initiatives. As an example of core-extending CSR, New Balance, an American MNC which produces athletic shoes, is committed to retaining a portion of its manufacturing base in the United States. This dedication to support home-based manufacturing is a core-extending CSR initiative since it interacts with several other current organisational routines of New Balance, and has moderate influence on its future organisational practices (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015; Yuan et al., 2011).

A core-periphery thesis has some similarity to the resource-based view (Carmeli & Tishler, 2004). The resource-based view highlights the content of an organisation's core capabilities which largely determine a firm's overall performance (Barney, 1991). In order to define the performance-enhancing core capabilities, one must review various organisational routines, which either reflect central or peripheral activities (Yuan et al., 2011). Baumann-Pauly et al. (2013) concluded in their qualitative empirical study of CSR in Swiss MNCs and small and medium-sized enterprises (SME), that CSR implementation varies according to a company's size; the bigger the company, the more attention it gives to external or peripheral CSR implementation practices; the smaller the organisation, the more internal CSR implementation activities are conducted in core business functions. This could be partly explained by the resource-based view. Most of the MNCs already have their core capabilities and routines defined on their journey to become multinational enterprises. Because of their important role to the organisation, these routines are stable over time and not easily divested as opposed to its peripheral routines (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015). However, when it comes to SMEs, they are more flexible than MNCs in terms of disrupting their core routines in favour of CSR (Baumann-Pauly et al., 2013). Another part of the explanation to Baumann-Pauly et al.'s (2013) finding could be the fact that not every MNC has the resources or capacity to embed CSR into its core activity like the ones unveiled by Aguinis and Glavas (2013). Based on the above given literature, I presume that organising CSR largely depends on a company's resources and capacities, and I formulate the following hypotheses.

H1. The MNCs in the fashion retail industry conduct more peripheral CSR activities than core CSR activities.

H2. Within the MNCs in the fashion retail industry, the amount of peripheral CSR activities is greater for larger MNCs.

2.3. Implementation of CSR

Since the 1950s, when CSR was first given academic attention to, numerous studies have been conducted around the very concept of CSR (Lindgreen & Swan, 2010). Many more have been carried out on the relationship between corporate social performance and corporate financial performance (Wood, 2010). However, the focal point of academic interest in CSR has recently moved from whether or not to commit to CSR, towards how to implement, integrate, maintain and improve CSR practices effectively within an organisation (Smith, 2003). The implementation of CSR has rapidly become the ‘hot’ topic for many researchers (Aguinis & Glavas, 2013; Asif et al., 2013; Baumann-Pauly et al., 2013; Niphof et al., 2004; van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015; Vitolla et al., 2016; Yuan et al., 2011).

Both views in favour of and against incorporating CSR closely into a company's core strategy are apparent in various academic studies. Developing and integrating CSR practices within the field of organisations' strategic management is mutually beneficial for an organisation and its surrounding community (Lindgreen et al., 2009). This argument was supported by Vitolla et al. (2016), who found that integrating CSR into strategic management is fundamental for CSR management. Aguinis and Glavas (2013) have studied CSR initiatives at GE, IBM and Intel, and provided empirical evidence to support the importance of core CSR. Katavic (2011) concluded that companies who focus...
on strategic CSR rather than sporadic philanthropic activities can achieve a competitive advantage, and “their stakeholder management, corporate citizenship, corporate philanthropy, and the business model will lead to sustainable growth”.

While plenty academic works have praised the usefulness of core or embedded CSR, there are few researches which endorsed the peripheral CSR activities. One of these studies was conducted by Yates and Hollensbe (2013), who explained how well-designed peripheral CSR practices can add more significant value to an organisation than core CSR programs. Preuss (2011) concluded that it is possible to have a wider conceptualisation of benefits other than just the immediate economic benefits from peripheral or innovative CSR.

Shifting away from both extremes, Van Balen & Haezendonck (2015) suggested that the CSR integration should be contingent upon the business environment. Baumsartner (2014) found that while developing an effective CSR strategy is part of the strategic management level, the implementation of the CSR strategy belongs to the operational management level. Nijhof et al. (2004) noted that implementing CSR requires collaboration and competencies of an organisation and its stakeholders at a collective level. According to Asif et al. (2013), CSR must be built into each level of an organisation to have a significant impact.

Several researchers have studied the integration of CSR into business processes through various case studies (Guadamillas-Gomez et al., 2010; Kolyperas et al., 2015; Smith & Lenessen, 2008; Zadek, 2004). To give an example, Zadek (2004) showed how Nike implemented CSR moving from a ‘defensive’ stage to ‘civil’ stage, where CSR was further institutionalised in the organisational setting as Nike progressed towards the ‘civil’ stage. Despite the increased research in this field, implementation and integration of CSR in business processes are still not clearly defined.

Yuan et al. (2011) have made progress in filling the gap of the research field and identified seven distinct patterns describing the integration of CSR practices in the firm, which are briefly summarised below.

1. ‘Born CSR oriented’ pattern is applied by firms that have integrated CSR practices as an important part of their core organisational routines from the very beginning (Yuan et al., 2011).
2. ‘Patching’ pattern is used to create new CSR core initiatives that interact with many other current organisational routines and have great influence on future organisational practices (Yuan et al., 2011).
3. ‘Thickening’ pattern defines organisations’ actions to add core-extending CSR practices which support and reinforce their existing core routines (Yuan et al., 2011).
4. ‘Positioning’ pattern covers a firm’s initiatives to add independent CSR routines that are not central to the firm’s strategy and operations and do not have much influence on the firm’s future organisational routines (Yuan et al., 2011).
5. ‘Relabelling’ pattern is the act of recognising already existing routines as being CSR oriented, whether core, core-extending or independent ones (Yuan et al., 2011).
6. ‘Trimming’ pattern covers a firm’s actions which divest both core and peripheral routines that are damaging to CSR, and eventually make space for additional CSR activities in the future (Yuan et al., 2011).
7. ‘Co-operating’ pattern describes a firm’s act of creating CSR routines through alliances (Yuan et al., 2011). According to van Baal & Hazendonck (2013) that segregated CSR implementation according to a company’s size, I formulate the following hypothesis to be tested empirically.

H3. The MNCs in the fashion retail industry integrate new CSR initiatives mostly by ‘positioning’ or ‘thickening’ patterns, or both.

2.4. CSR in private versus public enterprises

The five dimensions – environmental, economic, social, stakeholder and voluntariness – are consistently referred to in most of the currently available definitions of CSR (Dahlsrud, 2008). The academic roots of CSR lie within the stakeholder theory (Asif et al., 2013), which was first introduced by Freeman in 1983. This theory includes a company’s social responsibility towards all stakeholder groups affected by its actions (Freeman, 1983). Accordingly, when an organisation makes business decisions, it should consider not only the shareholders interest but also the interest of other stakeholders, such as its employees, customers, suppliers and the local community (Bonson & Bednárová, 2015). The framework of this theory makes reporting CSR practices an important means of communication for a firm to build a stable relationship with its stakeholders.

Privately held firms are owned by its founders, management or a group of private investors, whereas a publicly held company sells all or a portion of itself to the public via an initial public
offering, meaning that the shareholders can claim a part of the company’s assets and profits (INVESTOPEDIA STAFF, 2017). Consequently, public companies are required to disclose their financial reports to its shareholders, while privately held companies do not have this obligation (INVESTOPEDIA STAFF, 2017).

This suggests that publicly held companies could give more importance to shareholders than to any other stakeholders since their funding partly or completely depends on the prior group. DE VILSERS & VAN STADEN (2010) have researched the shareholder requirements for corporate environmental disclosures by surveying individual shareholders in Australia, the UK and the US. The general finding of the study reveals that respondents in the three countries are interested in CSR disclosures, more specifically in an overview of environmental risks and impacts, the environmental policy, performance against measurable environmental targets and information on a range of environmental costs. Within this section, the following hypothesis is formulated for empirical testing.

H4. Publicly held fashion enterprises conduct more CSR initiatives than privately held fashion companies.

2.5. Environmental and social obstacles of the fashion industry

Before the 1970s, the fashion industry had followed a fixed timeline of six months to one year to build a collection and launch it (BIRTWISTLE ET AL., 2003). Most of the manufacturing was home-based. However, today the standard turnaround time of six months to a year has been compressed to a matter of mere weeks by fast fashion companies (TOKATLI, 2008). Fast fashion retailers translate designs from the catwalk quickly into ready-to-wear clothes and sell them to the end consumers at an affordable price. Because they source the newest trends routinely and offer them for the fraction of its actual price, consumers keep coming back for more (TOKATLI & KAÇILOĞLU, 2009). The majority of the fast fashion retailers outsource their production to the Far East, where they get access to cheap labour. According to McCARTHY and JAYARATNE (2010), a significant portion of manufacturing had been relocated to developing countries in the past 30 years.

Together with the low-cost supply chain practices, the quality and safety of the workplace along with the workers’ labour rights have been largely ignored by the manufacturing companies (HALTSOEN ET AL., 2007). The fashion business is labour-intensive as it largely depends on human capital to produce its end products. Since the mid-1990s, some well-known multinational clothing retailers caught the media’s attention due to their link with the use of child labour, and the inhumane working conditions in factories located in developing countries (ISLAM & DEEGAN, 2010). One of the most recent incidents; the collapse of the Rana Plaza building, took place on 24 April 2013. It is considered as one of the worst industrial accidents in history (JACOBS & SINGHAL, 2017). According to JACOB and SINGHAL (2017), the stock market reaction to retailers after the incident was not significant except on the actual day of the disaster. However, as a reaction to this tragic event, two different agreements were developed by the retailers in order to improve factory and worker safety in Bangladesh.

Aside from the poor working conditions and the child labour, this industry has been frequently criticised for the harm it causes to the environment and the natural ecosystem. Most of the raw materials used in making clothes are natural resources like cotton, fossil fuel, leather etc. To process these raw materials into textiles, manufacturers make use of a lot of chemicals. A vast amount of the waste water contaminated with these toxic chemicals makes its way back to the ecosystem. Eileen Fisher, a conscientious clothing retailer, has famously said that “The clothing industry is the second-largest polluter in the world, second only to the oil industry.” (SZOKAN, 2016).

The other important environmental impact the clothing industry made, is the increasing transportation mileage due to the extended supply chain (TÜRKER & ALTUNTAŞ, 2014). Tight delivery demands often cause the fast fashion companies to use expedited shipping methods, i.e. by air (JOY ET AL., 2012), which significantly increase their already high CO2 emissions (SAICHEVA ET AL., 2012).

In today’s highly digitised and interconnected world, where the topic of environmental sustainability and social responsibility is given more attention, it is relatively easy for a brand to wreck its image by an irresponsible act. Since the controversial practices caught the attention of the public, major players of the industry have started voluntarily publishing different types of disclosure reports (TÜRKER & ALTUNTAŞ, 2014) to get their brand image back on track.

3. METHODOLOGY

The CSR reports will be studied using the content analysis method. One can define content analysis as “an observational research method that is used to systematically evaluate the symbolic content of all forms of recorded communication” (KOLBE & BURNETT, 1991). This analysis method is valuable in organisational research as it links qualitative and quantitative studies, and thus allows researchers to examine the variations of organisational behaviours, stakeholder perceptions, and societal trends (DURAU ET AL., 2007). BERG (2009) has noted this
method as a detailed, systematic approach to interpreting textual material to discern patterns. Using content analysis, one can convert qualitative data into quantitative data by evaluating texts with a coded system.

Although content analysis is often used by CSR researchers as a tool to analyse qualitative data (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015), which is often the company’s CSR reports, some academics argue that these reports contain self-reported company data that can portray biased self-representation of a company’s CSR engagement (Guthrie & Abeysekera, 2006; Wood, 2010). While I agree with the argument, I believe that CSR disclosure reports are the sole source of focused overview of the CSR initiatives conducted by the MNCs, considering the limitation and scarcity of other sources of data (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015).

3.1. Sample selection

The sample selection is based on several criteria. Since this is a comparative study, the data from the CSR reports needs to be equivalent.

Therefore, I began narrowing down the population of fashion retailers by choosing the ones that fall under the ‘fast fashion’ category. Cachon and Swinney (2011) has defined a fast fashion retailer as a retailer that “combines quick response production capabilities with enhanced product design capabilities to both design ‘hot’ products that capture the latest consumer trends and exploit minimal production lead times to match supply with uncertain demand”.

Next, I have looked at the availability of yearly CSR reports for each retailer. Since I wanted to analyse the adaptation pattern of CSR practices over several years, I selected MNCs which have consistently reported on their CSR activity, during the period between 2011 and 2015. Some MNCs reported their CSR activities in their annual reports while the others dedicated a separate report solely for their CSR initiatives during the given timespan. There was a one-off report written on New Look’s ethical trading practices in 2013. Content of this report has not been included in the analysis in order to obtain comparable data at the end of the research.

To discern differences between publicly and privately held companies with regard to their integration pattern of core and peripheral CSR practices, the sample has been further formed by selection of four major clothing retailers from each ownership category. The sampled retailers are among the multinational buying organisations which procure most of their products from low-cost developing countries. The result of the final sample selection is presented in Table 1. CSR reports are retrieved from the companies’ corporate websites.

3.2. Content analysis procedures

The content analysis procedures were mostly based on the methods presented in the article ‘Strategic Governance of CSR: A Multi-Industry, Multi-Period Analysis on Integration Dynamics’, written by van Balen and Haezendonck (2015).

Table 1. Sample overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inditex</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>111.17</td>
<td>152,854</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hennes &amp; Mauritz</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>44.47</td>
<td>148,000</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>521</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fast Retailing</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>36.33</td>
<td>89,580</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Next</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>10.19</td>
<td>47,562</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primark</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>20.89</td>
<td>61,000</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bestseller</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>15,000</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mango</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>6.82</td>
<td>16,623</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>496</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Look</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>16,500</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To improve the research validity and reliability, there were two coders involved in analysing the content of all CSR reports. The author of this thesis, who had prior professional experience in the retail fashion industry, coded the content first. Before coding the CSR initiatives, the first coder familiarised herself with the value, vision, mission and strategy of each sampled firm. The second coder also acquainted himself with the business operation, value, vision, mission and strategy of the firms, as well as the literature part of this thesis prior to checking the coded data. After the primary stage of the coding was done, the first coder explained to the second coder how it was done and how the CSR practices were identified and categorised. Then, the second coder randomly checked the coded data against the original sources and made sure that they agreed upon the coding decisions. This was done in order to establish the validity and reliability of the study (Krippendorff, 2004). In order to not miss reoccurring activities throughout the period of five years, the first coder has coded the reports simultaneously per MNC, rather than year by year. This has also helped her to discover new CSR activities easier.

Since the CSR reports have been criticised to be self-reported company data that can portray a biased self-representation of a company’s CSR engagement (Guthrie & Abeysekera, 2006; Wood, 2010), statements regarding companies’ existing processes and procedures such as we support, we do, we apply etc., were excluded with the exception of product safety requirements and animal welfare policies. The exclusion further extended itself to conditional and forward-looking statements such as we will, we plan, we aim etc. This left us with CSR initiatives which were effectively organised and reported with results during the reporting year.

The main focus of this research is to identify CSR activities of the retailers by applying the core-periphery thesis, and to discern CSR integration patterns of the retailers based on the seven integration patterns developed by Yuan et al. (2011). Therefore, I began coding CSR initiatives by assigning either the ‘core’, ‘extending’ or ‘independent’ category tag. Every new CSR practice was coded with another layer of integration pattern code or codes from Yuan et al. (2011). In consequence, a new core CSR activity was further coded as ‘patching’, a new extending practice was further labelled as ‘thickening’, and a new independent initiative was further identified as ‘positioning’. Depending on the context of the CSR practice, the integration pattern codes such as ‘co-operating’ and ‘trimming’ were added on top. For example, a retailer implements a ban on usage of animal fur for its products in the reporting year, then this CSR is coded as ‘core’ and ‘patching’, and since it is an action which divests a core routine that is damaging to CSR, it is also coded as ‘trimming’. More examples on coding are found in Table 2.

When coding, the below-mentioned criterions were followed in order to obtain parallel and comparable data throughout the reports of the chosen sample firms.

1. Consider sub CSR initiatives which elaborate a concise CSR practice as one initiative. To illustrate, when a retailer conducts sustainability audits throughout a financial year and reports the specific amounts of audits conducted per production country, then these separate amounts of audits were coded as one CSR practice.
2. CSR initiatives which are mentioned several times in the same reporting year are coded as one.

The identification of CSR initiatives was carried out through a line-by-line reading of CSR reports in the Atlas.ti software package for content analysis. In the first round of coding, a total of 1809 CSR initiatives were found. Subsequently, the second coder randomly checked the coded fragments against the core-periphery literature and the coding criteria. Eventually, some adjustments were made where deemed necessary. This narrowed the total CSR initiatives down to 1560. To enhance the quality of the coding, the first coder has further refined the initiatives by reassessing every coded quotation once more. After this step, the total number of CSR initiatives was reduced to 1517.

The final result of coding was then analysed by the Code-Document-Table function, and was exported to an Excel file. The result of the analysis is to be found in Table 3.
### Table 2. Illustrations of CSR initiative coding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First layer of coding</th>
<th>Quoted fragment from the report</th>
<th>Second layer of coding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Core</strong></td>
<td>“In 2011, together with about 60 other brands, NGOs and others, we signed a pledge facilitated by the Responsible Sourcing Network committing us to not knowingly use Uzbek cotton.” – H&amp;M 2011</td>
<td>Co-operating Patching Trimming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“... Inditex purchased in 2011 over 1000 tons of tencel, a fibre which is manufactured from eucalyptus Wood and which is totally biodegradable, while at the same time being especially suitable for sensitive skin as it does not cause any cutaneous irritations.” – Inditex 2011</td>
<td>N/Aa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“This year, we have decided to ban all per- and polyfluorinated compounds (also known as PFCs) which are mostly used for water repellence in jackets and snowsuits for children.” – Bestseller 2015</td>
<td>Patching Trimming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Extending</strong></td>
<td>“Primark launched a new informative website in 2011 to explain its open and transparent approach to business, corporate ethics and stakeholder engagement.” – Primark 2011</td>
<td>Thickening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“As of 2010, Next Directories are printed on paper produced from sustainably managed forests and controlled sources accredited by the Program for the Endorsement of Forest Certification Scheme.” – Next 2011</td>
<td>Thickening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“In fiscal 2012, Fast Retailing hired 136 people with physical or intellectual disabilities.” – Fast Retailing 2013</td>
<td>N/Aa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Independent</strong></td>
<td>“Mango financed a project for the construction of 30 homes and 2 schools in Anantapur, India, aiming to provide suitable housing and facilitate access to education.” – Mango 2011</td>
<td>N/Aa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“During the first year of the program, our staffs have volunteered just under 1000 hours, (that is the equivalent to £19,122) to 121 charitable activities.” – New Look 2011</td>
<td>Positioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“During the holiday season of 2015, we engaged our customers with the H&amp;M Foundation for the third year in a row. For every gift card sold at H&amp;M stores around the world during this period, the H&amp;M Foundation matched 5% of the purchased amount with a donation to UNICEF.” – H&amp;M 2015</td>
<td>N/Aa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: a. The second layer of coding was assigned only when the CSR initiative was new.
3.3. Data analysis

The data, exported to an Excel file, was then analysed per CSR type, i.e. ‘core’, ‘extending’, and ‘independent’, and per CSR integration pattern from Yuan et al. (2011), i.e. ‘patching’, ‘thickening’, and ‘positioning’. The CSR integration pattern codes ‘patching’, ‘thickening’, and ‘positioning’ correspond to the CSR type codes ‘core’, ‘extending’, and ‘independent’ respectively. Since there were another layer of implementation pattern codes, such as ‘co-operating’, and ‘trimming’ attached to the primary codes where appropriate, I have decided to investigate their co-occurring relationships with the initial three implementation pattern codes. To this purpose, I have used the Code Co-occurrence Table in Atlas.ti, and exported this as an Excel file. In the Excel software package, the table was transferred into a graph for a clearer overview.

In order to study the differences between the integration patterns of publicly and privately held corporations, both the CSR type classifications and the CSR integration pattern categories were analysed for the industry as a whole as well as for publicly and privately owned companies.

3.4. Findings

This portion of the thesis presents the findings of the content analysis done on 40 CSR reports of the chosen fashion retailers.

Table 3 provides the average counts of CSR initiatives between the years 2011-2015, per retailer and per ownership type. The opening conclusion that we can derive from the information provided, is that the MNCs organised on average more peripheral CSR practices than core CSR practices, with a ratio of 3 to 1. This is in line with Hypothesis 1. However, Hypothesis 2, which presumed a greater amount of peripheral CSR practices for bigger MNCs, is not substantiated. For the purpose of testing Hypothesis 2, the correlation coefficient has been calculated between the employee counts of each firm, and the share of peripheral CSR activities in the whole portfolio of CSR practices of the corporations. The correlation coefficient of -0.48 was found. This indicates a moderate negative relationship between the size of a firm and its peripheral CSR activities.

The next observation made is that the publicly owned MNCs organised twice as many, both existing and new CSR activities, compared to privately owned companies. A visual representation is provided in Figure 1. This finding supports Hypothesis 4, and can partly be explained by the fact that the reports published by the publicly owned MNCs were greater in length compared to those of privately owned corporations. In Figure 2, a scatter chart with a trendline showcasing the strong positive linear correlation between the CSR initiative counts and CSR report page counts. To give an example, the CSR reports of H&M contain on average about 89% more pages than those of Primark, and its total number of CSR activities is about 82% greater than those organised by Primark.

Table 3. Average CSR initiative counts (2011-2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ownership</th>
<th>Firm</th>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Extending</th>
<th>Independent</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td>Inditex</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H&amp;M</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fast Retailing</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Next</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Primark</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bestseller</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mango</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New Look</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Numbers are rounded up.
A Comparative Study on the Corporate Social Responsibility Practices of Global Clothing Retailers

Table 4 provides descriptive statistics on types of CSR practices organised by the eight firms, between the years 2011 and 2015. In the table, the mean, standard deviation, and row percentage per year are presented for the firms as a total, as well as for both publicly and privately owned enterprises separately. The numbers reveal that the extending CSR practices represent the largest share of the portfolio for the retailers combined, as well as for both public and private sector retailer groups. The independent CSR initiatives came on the second place, and were followed by the core CSR practices. The share of extending, independent and core CSR initiatives in the total CSR portfolio range between 42 to 48%, 29 to 33%, and 24 to 27%, respectively.

Figure 1. Average number of CSR initiatives

Figure 2. Correlation of CSR report page counts and CSR activity counts (2011-2015)
Table 4. Descriptive statistics on CSR types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Extending</th>
<th>Independent</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Numbers are rounded up.

In Figure 3, the average counts of CSR initiatives from Table 4 have been transferred into line charts. These charts show how each category of CSR activities of public and private companies have evolved during the chosen period of time. The first remark that can be made is that CSR practices of public retailers have more fluctuation throughout the period than those of private retailers. For example, the number of all three types of CSR initiatives of public firms rose significantly in 2013. A plausible explanation to this is the collapse of the Rana Plaza building, which took place on April 24, 2013, causing many retailers to come to an agreement to cooperate on improving factory and worker safety in Bangladesh (Jacobs & Singhal, 2017). This tragic event was not only a wakeup call to the clothing retailers, but it was also a shocking reality check for the consumers. In addition, many non-governmental organisations increased their demand for more transparent and ethical practices throughout the retailers’ supply chain. As for the private companies on the other hand, the numbers of core and extending practices stayed unvaried throughout 2013, and had slight changes in the following two years. The reason for this can be that the privately held companies do not have public investors, thus tend not to give as much importance to this kind of devastating events as the publicly held MNCs in the industry. Interestingly, the privately held retailers organised slightly more independent CSR initiatives in 2013. This suggests that private retailers depend mostly on peripheral CSR practices in the times of crisis to communicate and connect with its community and stakeholders, whereas publicly held MNCs initiate more routine disrupting core practices which eventually change how they do business daily.
4. CONCLUSION

This section elaborates on the results and examines plausible structural explanations for the main findings. Furthermore, the limitations of the research are defined.

The first plausible finding is that the MNCs in the fast fashion industry organise more peripheral CSR practices. This supports Hypothesis 1. Contradicting Hypothesis 2, this result is valid for all studied firms regardless of their size. From the point of a resource-based view, this outcome also proves the argument that it is not easy for most MNCs to disrupt or divest their existing core capabilities and routines in favour of desired core CSR practices (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015).

The next observation shows that out of all three types of CSR activities, the ‘extending’ CSR practice embodies the most CSR initiatives taken by the retailers. The ‘extending’ routines interact with several other current organisational practices and have moderate influence on future organisational routines (van Balen & Haezendonck, 2015). This finding shows that the fast fashion industry is striving to improve its innately controversial procurement methods and manufacturing processes. However, as the existing core capabilities and routines of MNCs are not easily divested, the firms tend to favour ‘extending’ CSR routines over ‘core’ or ‘independent’.

Another outcome of the research shows that the publicly owned MNCs organise twice as many CSR activities compared to privately held companies. This finding supports Hypothesis 4.
Although investment in CSR has been reputed to establish beneficial relationships with different stakeholders, the privately owned enterprises are less committed to CSR than their publicly held peers. Resource and capabilities available at hand, seem to be an important factor when it comes to initiating CSR practices. Correspondingly, the publicly held MNCs, which are in general larger in size and revenue than the private companies, conducted significantly more CSR practices than the privately held groups. The most notable difference between the two is the amount of the conducted ‘core’ CSR activities. In the year of 2013, when the disastrous collapse of the Rana Plaza building took place, the public companies initiated a considerably increased amount of ‘core’ initiatives, while the private groups’ CSR practices remained about the same.

Finally, the findings regarding the implementation patterns of new CSR practices reveal that the retailers implemented new CSR routines mainly via the ‘thickening’ pattern. Therefore, Hypothesis 3, which predicted retailers to use mostly the ‘positioning’ or ‘thickening’ patterns to implement new CSR routines, is confirmed. Moreover, the ‘co-operating’ pattern was apparent throughout the implementation of all three kinds of new CSR practices, while the ‘trimming’ pattern occurred primarily with the ‘core’ CSR initiatives. The main contrast between public and private MNCs when implementing new CSR was that the public companies cooperated more with others to integrate ‘core’ CSR routines.

A first limitation of the study is that even though I have made several efforts to improve research stability and reliability, there is an absence of review by managers from the investigated firms on the identification and categorisation of the CSR initiatives. I acknowledge that consulting these managers would have improved both the validity and reliability of the study.
A Comparative Study on the Corporate Social Responsibility Practices of Global Clothing Retailers

Table 5. Visualisation of co-occurring integration patterns of new CSR practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Core/Patching</th>
<th>Extending/Thickening</th>
<th>Independent/Positioning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>All MNCs</strong></td>
<td>Trimming</td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Diagram]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public MNCs</strong></td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Diagram]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Private MNCs</strong></td>
<td>Trimming</td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
<td>Co-operating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Diagram]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legend</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1. Business ‘core’ routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2. Business ‘extending’ routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3. Business ‘independent’ routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4. CSR ‘core’ routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5. CSR ‘extending’ routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6. CSR ‘independent’ routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Firm</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>Co-operating partner</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Visualisation is inspired by the figure ‘Seven patterns of CSR initiative adoption’ by Yuan et al. (2011).
The second limitation of the research is the self-reported nature of CSR disclosures. When there is no standardisation and eventual audit on such reports, it leaves room for companies to make exaggerated claims which is difficult to verify (Idowu & Towler, 2004). The final limitation to which this thesis is subject to is the reporting variation of the CSR disclosures. Three out of the eight MNCs investigated in this research, devoted a section of their annual reports to CSR. Compared to a standalone CSR report, the annual report content on CSR activities was rather small, except for the reports of Inditex Group. This could eventually explain some obvious deviations between the numbers of coded CSR activities from firm to firm.

A suggestion to future research in the field of CSR of the fashion industry is to choose more accurately comparable samples in terms of content. Additionally, an inclusion of different sizes and forms of firms in the study would contribute towards building a detailed explanation of various integration patterns.

**REFERENCES**


Durai, V. J., Reges, R. K., & Pfarer, M. D. (2007). A content analysis of the content analysis literature in organization studies: Research themes, data sources, and methodological refinements. *Organizational research methods, 10*(1), 5-34.


**BIOGRAPHY**

Nomindari Mendee has studied Master of Science in Management at the Vrije Universiteit Brussel (VUB). Her main scientific interests are in the areas of Corporate Social Responsibility, Supply Chain Management, E-commerce and Social Media Marketing. Currently she is working on her own business project. nomindari.mendee@gmail.com

Accountancy & Bedrijfskunde, 2017-4
A Comparative Study on the Corporate Social Responsibility Practices of Global Clothing Retailers


